



MANAGERS FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENT

a study

The Discussion Papers
#4: Recruitment



ASB
advisory services branch

CA2φN
TR 36
- 77D04

DEPOSITION LIBRARY MATERIAL

21 Ministry of Treasury,
Economics and
Intergovernmental
Affairs

D Miscellaneous publications

MANAGERS
FOR
LOCAL
GOVERNMENT
A Study

THE DISCUSSION PAPERS

IV. RECRUITMENT

Advisory Services Branch
Ministry of Treasury,
Economics and Inter-
governmental Affairs
6th Floor
56 Wellesley Street West
Toronto, Ontario

Winter 1977

In January of 1976 this Branch launched a study titled Managers for Local Government, the objective of which is to predict the qualitative and quantitative requirements for local government managers over the next ten years, and to recommend methods by which needs can be met.

A questionnaire was sent to all municipal clerks, treasurers, chief administrative officers and personnel officers. The responses were compiled and analysed in a report titled "The Data Base", released in June of last year. A similar questionnaire to council members has been analysed, and comparisons have been drawn with the analysis of the questionnaires to appointed officials. The questionnaires were backed by interviews in nearly 100 municipalities.

Using primarily those sources of data and opinions, this paper has been produced as the fourth in a series of papers to be issued by this spring. The topics of the papers are:

- Manpower Planning,
- Career Planning,
- Organization and the Management Focus (now in circulation),
- Recruitment,
- Education and Training,
- A Summary of Issues for Action.

These papers will be discussed with municipal associations, professional groups, individual municipal staff members and councillors, educators and opinion leaders.

A second series of papers, with more definitive recommendations, will follow. Discussions resulting from these papers will lead to the final report, which is planned for the late summer of 1977.

E.A. Gomme
Director
Advisory Services Branch



TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
INTRODUCTION.....	(i)
WHAT IS RECRUITMENT?.....	1
PROFESSIONALISM AND RECRUITMENT.....	5
MUNICIPAL RECRUITMENT.....	6
ATTITUDES TOWARD RECRUITMENT.....	7
Recruitment Sources (General).....	7
Council's Involvement.....	8
Recruitment Procedures.....	9
Background for Recruits.....	10
Recruitment Sources (Specific).....	11
QUALITIES FOR MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT.....	12
WHAT WILL BE REQUIRED OF THE FUTURE MANAGER?.....	15
RECRUITMENT BY TYPE OF MANAGEMENT JOB.....	20
Small Municipalities.....	20
Large Municipalities (Trainee/Assistants).....	21
Large Municipalities (Mid-Management).....	22
Large Municipalities (Senior Management).....	23
Large Municipalities (C.A.O.).....	24
HOW WILL MANAGERS BE RECRUITED?.....	26
WHERE WILL THE NEW MANAGERS COME FROM?.....	29
Administrative Trainees.....	31
Internship Programs.....	34
Staff Development Programs.....	36
SUMMARY.....	39
WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE?.....	41

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2024 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/31761120600143>

INTRODUCTION

This study is looking at management development in municipal government throughout Ontario, not in specific municipalities. Each of these Discussion Papers has assumed that if there is a problem of management development in a single local government, the same problem will likely have ramifications for others.

This paper looks at the recruitment of managers as it affects local government as a whole, not just as it affects the individual hiring municipality. It is based on the premise that the example of the engineering profession can also be applied to other disciplines within local government, and more specifically to the field of management.

A person hired as an engineer is also hired into the discipline of engineering. The person will be expected not only to grow within the specific job, but to assist the discipline in growing. Engineers have established criteria for membership in the discipline and this, of course, is used in recruiting people into engineering jobs. A code of ethics assists the individual once on the job. Engineering in one municipality is much like engineering in another, similar municipality.

It is assumed that a person being recruited into a management position in a specific municipality is also entering the field of municipal management in local government as a whole. The paper assumes there are identifiable attributes that a management recruit should bring to the job; that there is a level of "professional" competence that is acceptable to peers; and that practitioners of local-government management look on themselves not only as employees of a single municipality but as part of a Province-wide (perhaps nation-wide) community.

Bonnie N. Brown
Section Manager

David M. Michener
Local Government Adviser

Advisory Services Branch
Ministry of Treasury, Economics
and Intergovernmental Affairs
6th Floor
56 Wellesley Street West
Toronto, Ontario
M7A 1Y7

Telephone: 416/965-7031

WHAT IS RECRUITMENT?

Many people still feel that when a person is recruited into the employ of an organization, he is simply hired by that organization. But in modern personnel terms, recruitment means much more than that. Recruiting today involves replenishing, reinforcing, and sometimes restoring the vitality of an organization. The word carries with it suggestions of refreshing and reinvigorating.

Recruiting is the process of finding and hiring the best possible candidate for a job, but this process should not be carried out in a void. It should be accompanied by:

Manpower Planning

- to understand the degree of replenishing that will be needed through an examination of management skills available now and those that will be needed in the future;

Organizational Analysis

- to understand the degree of revitalization needed through an examination of the shape the organization is taking or will need to take;

Staff Development

- to understand the degree of reinforcement that will be needed through an examination of the skills that can be developed by those within the organization and the skills that will be required by the organization in the future;

Job Evaluation

- to understand the degree of reinvigoration that will be needed through an examination of the role of the job now and the role it will likely have as the organization develops.

Recruitment often takes place on the basis of finding and hiring a carbon copy of the incumbent. This is often the wrong approach because it does not incorporate the most beneficial elements of the process. The carbon copy will be able to handle and cope with the same problems as the incumbent, but in any dynamic situation the issues are continuously changing. Would the requirements of a management job filled in 1967 be the same if the job is to be filled in 1977?

The three phases of the recruitment process, and questions that need to be answered in each phase, are:

I. BEFORE RECRUITMENT

- What is the objective(s) of the organization, and how do the objectives of this specific job relate and contribute to the organization?
- What are the desirable (and minimal) levels of related experience that will qualify a person for this job?
- What are the desirable (and minimal) levels of formal education/training that will qualify a person for this job?
- What type of personality will be most suitable to the inter-action of the organization?
- Does the existing job description set out the responsibilities as they exist today?

- Is the job likely to change in the next few years, and should recruitment be based on the job as it exists or as it is likely to exist?
- Will the existing salary attract suitable candidates, and will the salary range allow sufficient compensation for the individual as he grows in the job?
- Are the existing reporting relationships within the organization correct in the existing situation, and for the job as it will likely evolve?
- Is the existing salary and benefits package competitive with that offered by similar organizations?
- Who will be in charge of the recruiting process?
- What budget needs to be established for this recruiting process?

II. DURING RECRUITMENT

- What journals and newspapers will be used when advertising?
- Who will design the ad and who will approve of the ad?
- Who will short-list the applications, and on what basis will the short-listing take place?
- Who will interview the short-listed candidates?
- Who will make the final decision as to which candidate is to be selected?
- Will there be any "bargaining" over the salary and benefit package?

III. AFTER RECRUITMENT

- Is there a planned approach to introducing the individual to the organization and to helping him establish relationships with colleagues and subordinates?

- Who will appraise the performance of the individual?
- Who will guide the individual in his continuing development to prepare himself for changing conditions or conditions that are likely to change?
- Who will regularly analyse the job and ensure that accurate descriptions of the job are maintained?
- What mechanism, policies and resources are available to the individual for his continuing growth and development?

PROFESSIONALISM AND RECRUITMENT

In very few situations is a person expected to spend the rest of his working years on a single job. Most employers expect, and sometimes insist, that an employee change jobs over a period of time. In large organizations this is referred to as career planning.¹

Within specific types of employer groups (e.g., the steel industry, automobile industry, financial industry) it can be expected that employees will leave one employer within the industry for a job with another.

In these situations, the person being recruited into a specific job is also purposefully being recruited into the "profession" associated with the job. The developmental activities to be undertaken by the person will be as much associated with the profession as they will be with the specific job. The career outlook of the individual will be as much toward the profession as the specific job or specific employer. Loyalty will be as much toward the profession as it is to the employer.

This attitude is as beneficial to the individual employee as it is to the employer. The employee is provided with a community in which he can grow and the employer is provided with a community from which he can expect to draw future employees.

¹For a more thorough examination of this topic see Career Planning, the second in this series of discussion papers.

MUNICIPAL RECRUITMENT

There are 835 municipalities in Ontario, each conducting its own recruitment and filling its own jobs. While the number of municipalities may change over the years, the fact remains that each will, and should, continue to conduct its own recruitment to fill its unique needs.

Along with this, there is a growing trend toward professionalism within municipal-government management; there are many associations and professional bodies of municipal managers; as is shown in the following pages, there is a great deal of mobility within the field of municipal management; most municipalities expect to get their management recruits from the staff of other municipalities; most existing managers expect to move on to another municipal job.

Given these facts--that each municipality operates independently in recruiting its staff, and that there is a growing professionalism and substantial mobility within the "profession"--it would seem to follow that municipal governments as employers should examine the possibility of a common approach to recruiting managers. The managers are already beginning to look on their jobs as a discipline or professional area.

ATTITUDES TOWARD RECRUITMENT

Included in the questionnaires that were sent to both senior municipal managers and council members, a series of questions relating to recruitment was asked. Approximately 600 (60%) of the managers surveyed responded to the questionnaire, as did about 660 (25%) of the council members to whom questionnaires were sent.

While not all questions were duplicated in the two questionnaires, the following two questions were asked on both questionnaires. It is interesting to note the similarity in responses from elected and appointed.

RECRUITMENT SOURCES (GENERAL)

How will your municipality most likely fill the need for additional management staff which you forecast?	<u>Managers</u>		<u>Council Members</u>
a) Internal promotion,	a)	31%	36%
b) Management trainees,	b)	10%	12%
c) Hiring from other Municipalities,	c)	23%	19%
d) Hiring from other levels of government,	d)	10%	9%
e) Hiring from private enterprise.	e)	20%	20%
f) Other.	f)	4%	7%
g) No response.	g)	46%	40%

N.B. Percentages total more than 100 because many respondents indicated more than one answer.

BACKGROUND OF RECRUITS (GENERAL)

In recruiting management staff, does your municipality demand:	<u>Managers</u>	<u>Council Members</u>
a) Experience as a manager?	a) 36%	33%
b) Technical experience?	b) 40%	33%
c) Previous municipal experience?	c) 49%	40%
d) A thorough knowledge of your municipality?	d) 19%	21%
e) Formal education background?	e) 46%	35%
f) A.M.C.T.?	f) 33%	16%
g) Another designation such as R.I.A., T.P.I.C., C.A.?	g) 17%	8%

N.B. Percentages total more than 100 because many respondents indicated more than one answer.

COUNCIL'S INVOLVEMENT

To determine the extent to which council members are involved in the recruiting process, they were asked the following question:

How is council involved in the filling of management positions? (You may wish to indicate more than one response).	<u>Council Members</u>
a) Reviewing and editing advertisements,	a) 18%
b) Screening all applications to select qualified applicants,	b) 45%
c) Interviewing all qualified applicants,	c) 46%
d) Interviewing "short-listed" applicants,	d) 21%
e) Approving appointments to staff.	e) 43%

An examination of these responses based on size and type of municipality shows that in very small municipalities all recruiting functions--advertising, screening, selecting--are performed at the council level. In medium-sized municipalities the screening and selecting is performed by council, while in

larger municipalities, generally only one or two short-listed applicants are interviewed. Of course, council makes the final selection.

The rule of thumb seems to be: councils screen and select those who will be reporting directly to council; managers screen and select those who will be reporting to management. In some municipalities all staff appointments outside the bargaining unit must be approved by council, although approval of management recommendations is usually automatic. In other municipalities council will be formally involved in the appointment of only the top line of management, with all other persons being appointed by management to positions that have been approved by council.

In the majority of situations, senior management will be involved in the recruitment process, often in screening and interviewing, and almost always in establishing the position's terms of reference.

RECRUITMENT PROCEDURES

When recruiting management staff or staff slated to enter the ranks of management, what procedural methods does your municipality use? (You may wish to indicate more than one response).

	<u>Managers</u>	
a) Internal notice,	a)	- 30%
b) Local newspapers,	b)	- 82%
c) Professional or trade periodicals,	c)	- 27%
d) National newspapers,	d)	- 22%
e) Consultants,	e)	- 5%
f) Promotion without posting,	f)	- 8%
g) Invitation to qualified people,	g)	- 23%
h) No response.	h)	- 6%

Most respondents indicated their municipality uses more than one recruitment method. As can be seen, the majority (82%) use local newspapers and at least one other vehicle. There was little variation according to size or type of municipalities, but larger municipalities tended to use trade periodicals, consultants, and invitations to qualified people more than the smaller municipalities.

BACKGROUND FOR RECRUITS (SPECIFIC)

To determine attitudes of managers toward recruitment of a person to replace them on the job, the following question was asked:

In your opinion, what would be required in the person to succeed you in your position?

		% of <u>380</u>
a) Educational background equal to yours,	a)	209 - 55%
b) Educational background superior to yours;	b)	<u>171</u> - 45%
	TOTAL	<u>380</u>
		% of <u>276</u>
c) 5 years or less job-related experience,	c)	144 - 52%
d) More than 5 years job-related experience;	d)	<u>132</u> - 48%
	TOTAL	<u>276</u>
		% of <u>319</u>
e) 5 years or less municipal experience,	e)	163 - 51%
f) More than 5 years municipal experience.	f)	<u>146</u> - 49%
	TOTAL	<u>319</u>

The most striking feature of the responses to this question is that opinion is evenly split on all aspects of this question. Only the clerk-treasurers and clerk-administrators felt that less than five years municipal experience was needed. Those under 35 years of age were generally more disposed toward an equal educational background for their successor, and those under 25 suggested less than five years experience was needed to perform their jobs.

RECRUITMENT SOURCES (SPECIFIC)

What is the most likely source from which the person to succeed you will be recruited?

	<u>Managers</u>
a) The staff of your municipality;	a) - 32%
b) Another municipality;	b) - 45%
c) Another level of government;	c) - 7%
d) Private enterprise;	d) - 23%
e) Directly from graduation from an educational institution;	e) - 5%
f) The ranks of council;	f) - 5%
g) Other. (Please specify briefly).	g) - 3%

This statistic shows that nearly half of all management respondents predict their successor will come from another municipality. It is also noteworthy that only one-third of the respondents feel there is now a person on staff who would be chosen to assume the respondent's job.

In all areas except cities that are not part of second-tier governments, respondents felt their successor was more likely to come from another municipality than any other source. In the cities it was felt the successor would usually come from the same municipality. Remote northern areas overwhelmingly (77%) felt another municipality would supply their successor. In counties a rather high percentage (11%) felt their successor would come from the ranks of council. This was the only category in which significant numbers indicated councillors might move into the administrative fold.

In all job categories, except personnel officer, the majority looked toward another municipality for their successor. The personnel officers were split over whether it would be another municipality or private enterprise.

QUALITIES FOR MUNICIPAL MANAGEMENT

As a result of the questionnaires and interviews, it is apparent there are varying criteria for management recruits depending on the size and style of the municipality and the importance of the position in the management structure of the municipality.

It is also apparent that there are four general areas that are considered in evaluating an applicant for a management job. Not all these attributes or skills will be necessary to the same degree in all management jobs, and the order in which they fall will be different for many types of jobs. The categories are:

Management Skills

- an ability to foresee and forestall problems in the allocation and use of human and other resources, an ability to see the job from the perspective of the entire organization; an ability to translate problems and answers into quantitative terms, an understanding of one's role in planning, organizing, directing and controlling resources; skills in establishing objectives, and monitoring progress toward these objectives, the use of leadership styles consistent with the goals and climate of the organization; an ability to use scarce resources effectively and efficiently.

Political Awareness

- an understanding of the political system; an understanding of the position held by a person within the decision-making process; an ability to work within a bureaucratic structure; an ability to accept and administer

decisions made by councils or superiors even if these decisions are not agreed to by the person; an ability to alter priorities according to social, financial and environmental changes; an ability to assume a high profile or a low profile, as the situation demands.

Communicative Ability

- an ability to express oneself clearly and precisely in both speaking and writing; an ability to understand and respond to both written and oral communications.

Mental Energy

- an ability to examine problems and situations and to apply remedial measures in a way which will correct the deficiencies; an ability to understand, and rationalize new techniques or procedures, and to apply those which will improve existing situations; an ability to think in both pragmatic and theoretical terms; a willingness to use untried but likely solutions to problems.

Technical Skills

- an ability to understand technical functions required by specific departments, such as bookkeeping or accounting, drafting or drawing; data processing or analysing; records processing or retention.

A person who possesses all the attributes listed above might well be termed the "ultimate" manager. The likelihood of finding this person is very small.

A municipality must look at its own problems and identify the attributes it needs the most.

Many municipalities have indicated that, when it comes time to replace an existing manager, the search will be for someone who is as much like the incumbent as possible. This is usually the wrong approach. If it is assumed that a person is hired because his specific attributes match the specific requirements of the day, it should also be assumed that a new set of problems, most likely requiring a different set of attributes, will be present when a replacement is being hired. A "carbon copy" of the incumbent would be able to maintain the status quo, but perhaps not equipped to tackle a new set or problems and situations.

You hire a person to meet a situation. When the situation is resolved, new ones crop up. You hire new people to meet new situations.

WHAT WILL BE REQUIRED OF THE FUTURE MANAGER?

If it is difficult to pin down what is required in management recruits today, it is doubly difficult to predict what will be required in the future; however, it is also necessary at least to attempt to qualify the skills and quantify the problems.

One thing that is immediately apparent, and unquestioned within the local-government community, is that managers in the future are going to have to be very adept at handling human resources. The chart on Page 19 indicates clearly that both existing managers and existing councillors feel that while there will be increases in total municipal employment, there will not be corresponding increases in the number of managers. As an example, only 14% of the respondents from counties predicted no increase in total employment, but 43% of these same respondents said there would be no increase in the number of managers.

The chart shows clearly that managers 10 years from now will have more people reporting to them. This means a corresponding increase in the number of personnel problems, the allocation and control of subordinates' work and the number of jobs and programs being overseen by the managers.

Perhaps this matter can be shown more simply by noting that there can be only one chief administrative officer, or clerk, or director of planning, but the

number of people reporting to that individual can, and probably will, increase. The ability to manage people, then, becomes one of the major factors in recruiting municipal managers over the next few years.

The Honourable Darcy McKeough, Minister of Treasury, Economics and Intergovernmental Affairs, has stated several times that the Government intends to transfer to local governments a number of matters now handled to a large extent by the Province. Included in this category are responsibilities for real property assessment and land-use planning. When these transfers of responsibilities take place it is obvious that additional management demands will be placed on local government, not only in establishing work units to handle the task but also in incorporating the function into the overall municipal organization.

There are many other additional responsibilities that could be considered. There has been rapid development of social services within local government over the past few years, as shown in such programs as housing, recreation, and day-care facilities. Even cursory examinations of newspaper reports show that pressure for more of this type of service is continuing, and that new services are proposed continuously by individuals and groups within the municipality. The task of measuring the impact of these demands on the financial and human resources of the community will become an even greater problem.

There are other possibilities, such as shorter work weeks and the "double staffing" this could create; a reduction in the number of ad hoc bodies and the additional work load that would fall directly on the municipal council and its staff; continuing inflation and the tightening of financial resources; technological advances in areas such as sewage collection and treatment that could completely alter the existing staff structure as well as the physical operation; energy shortages that could result in local government adopting a greater role in energy distribution, perhaps as the agent of another level of government; constitutional revisions that could re-divide the authority between federal, provincial and municipal governments; the establishment of political parties at the municipal level; major changes in the average age, wealth, or social make-up of the population. This list, of course, could be endless.

Local government is big business. Last year the 835 local governments within Ontario spent well over three billion dollars, ranging from budgets of about \$35,000 in the smallest municipality to over \$600-million in the largest. A catch phrase circulating these days says that municipal government is often the biggest business in the municipality.

With population increases and increasing urbanization it is highly unlikely that these expenditures will decrease. This indicates a greater awareness of money management will be required.

Environmental issues continue to be among the major concerns of local government. These rarely are confined within the boundaries of a single municipality. This indicates a greater awareness of inter-governmental relations will be required, particularly in those matters where the provincial and federal governments are concerned.

To some degree these issues will be felt throughout local government, and more specifically by the managers in local government. The reality of common problems suggests the reality of common approaches to the problems. Can this equation be extrapolated to suggest that common approaches should be taken in recruiting and filling the management positions?

COMPARISON OF
PREDICTED INCREASES
IN TOTAL STAFF AND
MANAGEMENT STAFF,
(PREDICTED MANAGEMENT
INCREASES SHOWN IN
PARENTHESES)

	Reorganized Upper-Tier Municipalities	Area Municipalities Within Upper-Tier Municipalities	Counties	Municipalities Represented on County Councils	Cities not Part of an Upper-Tier Government	Municipalities, Except Cities, not part of an Upper-Tier Government
No Increase	6% (30%)	5 (19)	14 (43)	19 (49)	3 (7)	16 (48)
5 Percent or Less	17% (42%)	34 (48)	50 (43)	42 (36)	21 (62)	35 (32)
6-10 Percent	39% (12%)	28 (16)	14 (14)	20 (9)	31 (10)	22 (9)
11-20 Percent	28% (12%)	18 (9)	21 (0)	11 (0)	21 (10)	14 (4)
Over 20 Percent	11% (6%)	16 (9)	0 (0)	7 (4)	24 (10)	13 (7)
Total Number of Respondents	35	169	30	536	59	204

N.B. Percentages have been rounded off, and may not always total 100%.

N.B. This chart combines responses from council members and managers.

RECRUITMENT BY TYPE OF MANAGEMENT JOB

While this paper began with the assumption that recruitment to management in a single local government is also recruitment into the discipline of local-government management, it must be recognized that there are varying levels of management within the varying types of municipality. For the purpose of this paper it appears necessary to identify five specific types of management jobs and the sources of recruits for these jobs today and in the foreseeable future.

- in a small municipality;
- trainee/assistant in a medium-to-large municipality;
- mid-management in a medium-to-large municipality;
- senior management in a medium-to-large municipality;
- chief administrative officer.

I. SMALL MUNICIPALITIES

In small municipalities the demand for "day-one" skills is much higher than it is in larger municipalities. In the very small municipalities no management background is demanded, most likely because the full "management" function is performed more at the council level than at the administrative level.¹

¹ See Organization and The Management Focus, the third in this series of discussion papers.

As long as councils continue to perform the management functions of planning, organizing, staffing, directing, reporting, budgeting, the "managers" (clerk-treasurers) will need little in the way of management experience at the time of recruitment, and will not need to develop more than basic administrative skills while on the job.

Administrators in this type of municipality will most likely come from these sources:

- the staff of a similar but smaller municipality;
- local persons with some business experience or a thorough knowledge of the municipality and the people who live there;
- community college graduates in municipal administration who have achieved some degree of municipal experience through such methods as summer placement programs;
- the ranks of council or former councils.

II. LARGE MUNICIPALITIES

(*Trainee/Assistant Jobs*)

In many larger municipalities a variety of positions on the threshold of management has been created. The titles are as varied as the situations for which the jobs were created. Research officer, liaison officer, assistant to the ..., committee secretary, organization analyst, budget analyst are among the types of jobs included in this category.

In some municipalities with a job classification system, those hired into a relatively high classification (e.g., hired at level IV in a system that classifies positions from levels I to X) are designated as trainees.

In these situations the municipality generally recruits from among recent graduates of post-secondary education programs. Often a graduate degree is required. During the interviews it was discovered that the M.B.A. degree is considered preferable to an M.P.A. degree, because of the heavier concentration on "business" in the former. The emphasis is on "day-one" skills, usually analytical in nature. A second major source of recruits for this type of position is the municipality itself. Municipalities that have internal training programs or that encourage formal education programs for staff members often use vacancies in this type of job to promote staff members who have undertaken developmental programs and who have exhibited an ability to perform within the municipal structure.

III. LARGE MUNICIPALITIES

(*Mid-Management Jobs*)

Mid-management positions are difficult to define, considering local government as a single employer, but certainly "deputies" and major program section heads fit into this category. In some municipalities mid-management

is considered to be all jobs that are neither part of the bargaining unit nor at the level of department head. This definition most closely fits the Province-wide picture.

In upper-tier municipalities, those recruited into mid-management jobs have been recruited from the mid-management of lower-tier municipalities. To some degree these people simply moved into upper-tier governments as the duties they performed were transferred from lower-tier government. From the time of formation upper-tier governments have relied heavily on the local expertise of the staff of area municipalities. This trend shows no signs of abating.

Within "established" cities and towns, the mid-management group appears to be coming equally through internal promotion and recruitment of recent post-secondary graduates. In specific departments, such as personnel, public works and treasury, there is a continuing infusion of people from private industry.¹

IV. LARGE MUNICIPALITIES

(*Senior Management Jobs*)

Proven management ability through municipal experience is the major criterion in recruiting department heads. Education is always a secondary condition, and is sometimes not even mentioned in the recruitment procedure.

¹An examination of specific types of jobs and most likely sources of recruits is found in Manpower Planning, the first in this series of discussion papers.

In upper-tier municipalities, department heads tend to be recruited from among the department heads of lower-tier municipalities. In the cities and towns, department heads come through internal promotion, or from smaller cities or towns.

Only in the fields of land-use planning and personnel is there much likelihood of a department head being appointed without municipal experience. Municipalities that use the "deputy" system nearly always promote the deputy to department head status.

V. LARGE MUNICIPALITIES

(Chief Administrative Officer)

When municipalities first began appointing chief administrative officers, the practice was to select the head of one of the major departments for promotion to the new position. In the smaller units of government this was almost always the clerk.

Until about 10 years ago, the vast majority of those holding the position of C.A.O. were engineers, hard services being the main problems facing municipalities. In more recent years a number of the C.A.O.'s have come with a strong background in the treasury department, financial matters being the biggest problem faced by the municipality. In the last two years or so another change has been taking place. There have been examples of chief administrative

officers coming directly into local government from private enterprise and from other levels of government or governmental bodies. The stress appears to be on "management" rather than "municipal" in evaluating the experience required of a recruit. Increasingly, the specific knowledge being required of a C.A.O. is in the area of intergovernmental relations and human relations.

HOW WILL MANAGERS BE RECRUITED?

Recruitment procedures do, and should, take the simplest form possible. In a market where there are substantial numbers of qualified applicants for a job, the recruitment procedure may be as simple as reading through applications on file. The more sophisticated the job is, and the narrower the supply of applicants, the more sophisticated the recruitment procedure will be.

No management job within local government is simple. Even in the one-man office, or the part-time one-man office, there are management skills which must be applied. As noted in Organization and the Management Focus, the third in this series of discussion papers, many of these management functions may be performed at the council level. In some cases all will be. The municipal clerk-treasurer is, even in these cases, left with the responsibility of co-ordinating some activities and is required by The Municipal Act to carry out some duties.

When managers were asked how their municipalities advertise management vacancies it became evident that a wide variety of vehicles are used.¹ It also became evident, on examining the reasons for these different approaches, that there is no obvious single publication in which local-government management positions could be advertised.

¹See chart on Page 19

As already noted in the second of this series of papers, Career Planning, many small municipalities advertise positions in Municipal World. Medium-sized municipalities often use this magazine when advertising junior and mid-management positions. Engineering jobs are usually advertised in engineering publications; planning jobs through planning publications.

Many municipalities, particularly the smaller, advertise only in local newspapers.

Personnel consultants are used by some of the larger municipalities when they are attempting to fill senior positions. In some cases it has been reported that councils invited specific people to apply for specific jobs, bypassing traditional advertising procedures.

There have been suggestions, particularly from the smaller municipalities, that their recruitment procedures have not been attracting the type of candidate the municipality had hoped to attract. Some others, mostly council members, said they did not know how to go about recruiting management staff. One specific response from the mayor of a town reads: "We have not had any changes in the management group for 18 years, and that kind of a record doesn't allow for much experience in hiring new managers".

When municipal staff members were asked to comment on recruitment practices, particularly job advertising, they suggested:

- advertise in local newspapers and in a professional or trade journal. Municipal World was specifically mentioned by many.
- make sure that the advertisement includes a brief description of the job, a description of the desired education and experience background, the salary range that is proposed, the date when the successful applicant will actually start working, the date of closing of applications, and the name of an individual to whom the application should be addressed, and who may be contacted if additional information is required.
- make sure there is enough time (at least three weeks) between publication of the advertisement and closing date for applications for prospective applicants to consider a move and to respond.

WHERE WILL THE NEW MANAGERS COME FROM?

When this question was asked at the 1976 conference of the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, Mayor Gordon Dean of Stoney Creek, a member of a panel, said:

"....I believe that future municipal administrators can come from anywhere. I qualify that sweeping statement by adding that the potential administrator must have shown his ability to manage the operation he is engaged in at present, but the nature of the enterprise is very much less important than the nature of the person".¹

Mayor Dean's remarks paraphrase the responses to the questionnaires used in this study. As can be seen on the chart on Page 15, experience is the major requirement foreseen for municipal managers.

While there is agreement that experience is the main qualification for management recruits, there appears to be some difference of opinion over what constitutes that experience. Mayor Dean suggests that it is experience as a manager, and that the type of enterprise managed is not as important as the ability of the individual to manage. The questionnaire responses, backed by the results of the interviews, indicate strongly that municipal experience is the main qualification. Only in small municipalities, and departments of large municipalities such as law, personnel and purchasing, was there a suggestion that new managers could be brought in from private enterprise.

¹ See Summary of Remarks, Ontario Municipal Administrators' Association session, August 10, 1976, prepared by R.J. Metrick.

It may be correct to assume that "municipal experience" includes "management experience" since the question revolved around the recruitment of senior managers.

There are two problems inherent in recruiting only those with substantial municipal experience. The first is that, as already shown in this paper, more and more education/training/development will be required in future managers. Throughout the study it has been made clear that it is difficult for municipal employees to get either the financial backing or the time to attend formal learning programs. The fact that few people expect their replacement will come from the staff of their own municipality indicates there is little in the way of formal or informal management development. Without this type of development the existing municipal employee may not be qualified to meet the demands of management in the future.

The second problem, of course, is that those with strong management backgrounds or strong educational backgrounds, but no municipal experience, will have difficulty breaking into local government. The problem might be summarized this way:

- municipal experience is the major qualification for recruits to municipal management;
- the majority of new municipal managers will come from the ranks of the existing mid-management group;

- future managers will need greater skills in managing human resources, and a greater understanding of social, economic and environmental problems;
- the skills needed by future managers can, to a great extent, be gained through education/training/development programs;
- existing mid-managers find difficulty getting time or financial support to become involved in traditional formal educational programs;
- survey results indicate there is little in the way of on-the-job training now available;
- those with well-honed management skills, as a result of work in private industry or business, will have difficulty breaking into local government because of the "municipal experience" qualification.

There is a variety of ways to overcome these problems, each involving techniques and programs with broad acceptance in private industry and at other levels of government, but which are new or infrequently used in local government.

These include administrative trainees, internship programs, and formal developmental programs for those already in the municipal service.

I. ADMINISTRATIVE TRAINEES

In this type of program recent graduates of post-secondary institutions, usually those with a bachelor's or master's degree, are hired into local government in positions where they are not required to have "day-one" skills.

The type of position most used is committee secretary, assistant to ... (a management official), research officer. Trainee systems almost always require the person to work in a series of municipal departments rather than only one. The trainee position lasts two and sometimes three years. If the person has not found a permanent job with the municipality in that period of time, employment is terminated.

The administrative trainee system provides educated people with the experience qualification so necessary in local government. It also provides the individual with experience in a variety of municipal departments, and the "general" knowledge of the municipality that is demanded of senior management.

For an administrative trainee system to operate, it is necessary to identify a level within the administrative structure in which the trainee could most appropriately be placed. Obviously, the job will not be in the ranks of either senior management or junior office staff. If non-management jobs could be graded from one to ten (ten being the most senior), the administrative trainee would most likely fall in the five-seven category.

The Halifax Experience

The City of Halifax is one of the few Canadian jurisdictions that has a functioning administrative trainee program. The program has been in existence for six years. Of the 15 people who had been involved in the program up to 1976, three have remained with Halifax and the majority of the rest found jobs with other municipalities.

In 1976 the city budgeted \$90,000 for the administrative trainee program. Recruits must have a high level of formal education, though not in any specific discipline, and what might best be termed "drive".

The university graduates are hired for two years as generalists. They, with the program administrator, plot career paths that normally require each trainee to move from one municipal department to another every six months. A typical career path would involve serving in four of the following departments: finance, city manager, engineering and works, parks and recreation, social planning, development, mayor's office. Salaries in 1976 ranged from \$11,466 to \$15,156.

At the end of the two-year period the administrative trainees are expected to have located permanent employment within the municipality. In unusual cases, an additional year of the program can be made available. In the Halifax experience the additional year has not been needed and, indeed, the problem is one of getting the trainees through a full two years before they are offered permanent employment by a specific department.¹

¹For a more detailed analysis of the program, see the appendices in the July, 1975, Municipal Training and Exchange Program report prepared by Don Olmstead for the Council of Maritime Premiers.

The London Experience

A modified administrative trainee program is operated in the Department of Finance, City of London. Known as the Financial Management Trainee Program, it has been operating for three years. The program was instituted to overcome the problem of attracting well-educated individuals to a system in which there were only two normal entry points: the management level, where local government experience is a requirement; and the lower end of the non-management level, where it was felt jobs did not usually carry with them the type of responsibility for which the college or university graduate is suited.

II. INTERNSHIP PROGRAMS

This arrangement is normally a required part of a post-secondary learning program, or a professional body's accrediting program. Traditionally, a student will complete the "classroom" part of a learning program, and then be required to work in a municipality for a specific period of time before graduating. The work is part of the degree or diploma requirements.

Another example is where a student will work in a municipality for a period of time, usually four months, return to school for four months, back to the municipality, and so on, until the degree or diploma requirements are completed.

A third example is where the municipality itself establishes an internship program for those employees who are seen as likely candidates for senior positions. Once again, it is combination of work and school, with the educational element being undertaken away from the work environment. Usually, the intern agrees to complete a degree or diploma program to justify the employer's commitment.

One type of internship program, in a modified form, is the Involvement in Municipal Administration (IMA) program funded jointly by the Ministry of Treasury, Economics and Intergovernmental Affairs and individual municipalities. Under this program, municipalities hire undergraduate students from post-secondary institutions for a period of up to twenty weeks during the summer. The Ministry pays up to 75% of the salaries. Students can be hired into the areas of administration or planning. This year up to 360 students will be hired. The program is generally considered to be successful in providing students with the "municipal experience" qualification for entrance into the municipal service.¹

¹For a quantitative assessment of this program, see the 1975 and 1976 program reports issued by the Subsidies Branch, T.E.I.G.A. Qualitative analysis is included in IMA Program Assessment and Recommendations, Special Studies Section, Local Policy Planning Branch, T.E.I.G.A., October, 1973.

This program has been used by at least one college, Niagara College of Applied Arts and Technology, to fulfill the municipal experience qualification for graduation from its Government Operations program.

III. STAFF DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMS

The methods listed so far have involved only recent college or university graduates. Another source of future managers is the existing municipal civil service. Where formal education and/or broader experience would provide an individual with the background for entering senior management, the following approaches could be examined.

i) Day-Release Program

In this type of activity a member of staff is allowed and encouraged to undertake formal post-secondary courses, and is given time off work to attend school. Day-release is most common when the municipality requires specific types of training or education in order to carry out new responsibilities.

ii) Sabbaticals

The sabbatical is a period of time away from work, measured in months, where the individual undertakes a specific program of learning or research and where a major part of his normal salary is paid by his employer. It is most common in educational institutions but has begun to spread into both private industry and governmental circles.

iii) Internal Training

An employer will identify an area in which its staff members do not have sufficient background, and establish a program using either internal trainers or outside sources to provide this training. It can take the form of "simply learning as you go", or a course/seminar which is attended by staff members. If management training is the subject, the employer must be willing to allow the participants to become part of the decision-making process in order to apply the techniques learned in courses, or to learn by doing.

iv) Lateral Movement

In this type of program the employer purposely moves an employee through a series of different job situations in an attempt to make the person more aware of the overall requirements of the employer, as well as the differing styles and techniques of management used or needed in the various areas. Typically, an employee would be involved in such areas as finance, engineering, planning, or the clerk or C.A.O. departments. The departments and levels of work chosen for the lateral movement program are in keeping with the exhibited skills of the employee and the predictable requirements of the municipality. In a situation where the municipality has too small a staff to permit lateral movement, a group of municipalities could exchange staff in order to provide this type of development.

v) Exchange Programs

In small municipalities, where lateral movement or in-service training might be considered impractical, a program of inter-municipal exchange of staff might be considered. In this type of program staff from mid-management would be exchanged with other municipalities for a period of time ranging between three months and a year in order to learn new management techniques and systems, and to learn how to apply management skills in different situations. While this type of program is usually envisaged as involving municipalities of relatively equal size and type, it would not eliminate exchanges between large and small municipalities, or urban and non-urban communities.

SUMMARY

1. The qualities demanded of management recruits in municipalities today, in order of preference are:

- municipal experience;
- management experience;
- educational or professional qualifications;
- technical skills.

A fifth category, political awareness, is also demanded but since most feel it is not quantifiable, it is not included in a list of qualities to be "measured" on applications or interviews.

2. It is possible for educational institutions or professional bodies to offer learning programs in which knowledge of municipal government, management, politics, and technical knowledge is gained, but it is impossible for these institutions to offer job experience within the classroom. As a result, graduates have great difficulty finding jobs in local government.
3. There are a variety of methods by which education and experience can be coupled. These include:

- administrative trainee programs where graduates are placed in municipalities, with a salary, for a period of time, usually two years.
- internship programs where students spend part of a year in school and part working in a municipality;
- summer placement programs, such as the Involvement in Municipal Administration program now sponsored by the Province;
- sabbaticals for experienced municipal managers;
- day-release programs for managers to attend regular university or college courses;
- correspondence courses coupled with seminars.

4. Only the very largest municipalities have the human and financial resources to become involved in courses of action listed above, and another method of funding would be necessary if smaller municipalities are to use this type of development.
5. Recruits to most senior municipal jobs will come from the existing staff of other municipalities, thereby causing a "chain reaction", yet no thought has been given to an overall, municipality-wide approach to either recruitment or internal development of managers.
6. Between 500 and 700 management jobs open up in local government throughout the Province each year, yet most are "hidden" through lack of Province-wide publication of the job vacancies, and in some cases, lack of publication of the job vacancy outside the municipality.

WHAT NEEDS TO BE DONE?

Advertising

Should all municipalities be encouraged to advertise management jobs in a single journal in an effort to make practitioners aware of job openings and in effort to encourage careers within local government?

Should guidelines or models be prepared for use in advertising municipal management jobs?

Candidate Selection

Should guidelines be prepared for use by municipalities in selecting candidates for management jobs?

Should levels of knowledge and skill most appropriate for performing specific types of jobs in local government be identified?

Should placement/recruitment assistance be provided through such measures as an "inventory" of qualified people seeking employment or advancement within local government?

Education Vs. Experience

Should educational institutions be encouraged to incorporate internship programs for students planning careers in local government?

Should municipalities, collectively, establish methods to encourage staff members to undertake upgrading or advanced education/training programs?

Should an administrative trainee program be established for local government as a whole?

Should individual municipalities introduce plans by which staff can gain experience in a number of departments or in a number of municipalities?

Should a fund be established from which municipal management practitioners can draw to assist them in education/training, development programmes?

